

Comparative studies on two types of chilling methods in poultry slaughterhouses in Khartoum State, Sudan

Sit Albanat M. Elhassan Ali and Elniema A. Mustafa*

Department of Food Safety and Veterinary Public Health, College of Veterinary Medicine, University of Bahri, Khartoum, Sudan.

KEYWORDS ABSTRACT

Poultry slaughterhouses Chilling methods Process steps Bacterial contamination The study aimed to evaluate the effect of chilling methods and their related process steps (scalding, de-feathering, evisceration, and chilling) on chicken bacterial load in poultry processing plants in Khartoum State during the period from November 2019 to May 2020. Immersion and air chilling methods were both investigated in eight poultry slaughterhouses, four slaughterhouses for each method. Both checklist and microbiological tests were used in the evaluation. A total of 160 samples were collected from 32 carcasses, four carcasses were taken after each process step, from five parts of broiler carcasses (wings, legs, thigh, breast, and backbone) and all these samples were examined bacteriologically. The samples were subjected to the total bacterial count and isolation of Enterobacteriacea and E. coli. The result revealed that the mean bacterial load count of legs samples was highly significantly greater in emersion method $(2.1\pm.05)$ compared to air chilling method $(.7\pm.1)$, p=0.00 Also, the result indicates highly significant differences between the two chilling methods with regard to E. coli+Salomnella and E. coli+Enterobacter (0.00), E. coli+Shigella (0.001), E. coli+Citrobacter (0.00). When comparing the chilling methods with their respective process steps, scalding process showed no significant difference between the two chilling methods. Concerning scalding water change during each shift, all slaughterhouses (100%) were not changing scalding water. Washing process step revealed no significant differences between the two chilling methods in terms of in and out washing of carcasses, P.214 and .500, respectively. For chiller temperature all plants using air chilling practiced optimal temperature (4° C or less), while three quarters (75%) of plants using immersion chilling exceeded the acceptable limit but there were no significant differences between the two chilling methods, with p>0.071. In conclusion the microbial contamination of poultry meat in slaughterhouses in Khartoum State was higher in emersion chilling method compared to air chilling method.

INTRODUCTION

The legal frame of food safety in Sudan started with the Public Health Act (1939) which deals with food hygiene issues. Poultry industry is growing very fast since the last ten years in Sudan. This rapid growth involved diversified stakeholders in poultry production without having proper training and knowledge in hygienic practices, and food safety system include hazard analysis and critical control point (HACCP) (Mustafa *et al.*, 2016).

Mustafa *et al.* (2016) reviewed research studies conducted in Khartoum State. These reflected that the situation of microbial and chemical contamination in poultry and red meat in the slaughterhouses and factories of Khartoum State was higher than the level recommended by international regulatory bodies. This was attributed to the absence of implementation of Good Manufacturing Practices and Good Hygiene Practices. This was also evidenced by Munir *et al.* (2014) who investigated the bacterial contaminants of poultry meat and poultry products in Khartoum State and revealed that *E. coli* represented the highest contaminant with prevalence of 34.6% followed by Proteus spp. 32.2%, then Citrobacter spp. 13.5% and Salmonella spp. 10.4%.

Contamination of broiler meat with Salmonella spp., *Escherichia coli* and Staphylococcus spp. was evident in many studies. Ahmed (2014) assessed the measures of poultry meat safety in one of the Khartoum State slaughterhouses with the aim to detect the bacterial load and types of bacteria on the carcasses of broiler by applying the principles of HACCP. The contaminating bacteria isolated in the study were *E. coli*, *Staphylococcus spp.* and Salmonella spp. organisms. Contamination of broiler meat with Salmonella spp. and *Escherichia coli* were predominant in slaughterhouse processing as reported by Omer *et al.* (2015) who studied poultry meat carcasses at an automatic slaughterhouse in Khartoum State.

Enterobacteriaceae is a useful indicator of hygiene and post processing contamination of heat-processed foods. This family has been used as indicators of food quality and also for food safety. Enterobacteriaceae counts are an effective method to assess environments, such as post process food contact surfaces and help to quickly determine potential sources of contamination (Halkman *et al.*, 2014). To this end, quality assurance programs in slaughterhouses are applied to ensure the safety of meat for human consumption (Govender, 2014). The objective of this study was to evaluate the effect of chilling method and its related process steps on chicken bacterial load in poultry processing plants in Khartoum State.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Study Area

This study was conducted in the three localities of Khartoum State; Khartoum, Omdurman and Bahri.

Study design

A cross sectional and analytical study that lasted for 28 weeks from November 2019 to May 2020 was carried out in eight poultry slaughterhouses. Of these, seven were commercial poultry companies and one was a commercial slaughterhouse serving small poultry farms.

Chilling methods and related process steps

Air chilling and immersion chilling were the two investigated chilling methods, whereas the related process steps were a) scalding (scald temp and turbulence used; scald time per seconds); b) De-feathering (time sprayed with water -seconds); c) Evisceration (viscera mechanically opened; chickens hanged on legs till the end of evisceration; the technique for viscera suction); d) inside and outside washing (water temp.-washing duration).

Two slaughterhouses in Khartoum locality used air chilling method, four slaughterhouses in Omdurman locality used both air chilling method (two slaughterhouses) and immersion chilling method (two slaughterhouses) and two slaughterhouses in Bahri locality used immersion chilling method (one of which was commercial serving small poultry farms). Both checklist and microbiological tests were used in the evaluation.

Collection of Samples and sample Size

Simple random swab sampling of 160 swab samples were collected from the investigated poultry slaughterhouses.

Type of Samples

All samples were taken from 32 carcasses. Twenty swab samples were collected from 4 carcasses in each slaughterhouse from 5 parts: leg, thigh, breast, wing and backbone in 4 different process steps: after scalding, after de-feathering, after evisceration and after chilling.

Sample collection and transport

The samples were taken directly during the processing in the investigated slaughterhouses which operated in the morning shift except one (the commercial slaughterhouse) operated at night.

In the slaughterhouse, an average of 11,000 birds were killed per day during one shift either in early morning or in the evening. Each day, five parts of carcasses were randomly collected before they entered the chilling system and after entering in four different process steps: scalding, defeathering, and in and out carcass washing and chilling.

Samples were packed in sterile polyethylene bags and transported to the laboratory of the College of Veterinary Medicine at University of Bahri using an insulated ice box contained an ice pack at 4°C.

Bacterial Count

The total bacterial count is one of the key indicators in the field

of hygiene management. Standard plate or viable count a sample is diluted in a serious of dilution blanks, then the dilutions plated from 5th serial dilution onto MacConkey media for Enterobacteriaceae.

Microbiological analysis

Aerobic colony count (ACC), Enterobacteriaceae and coliforms using ISO 4833 and *E. coli* using ISO 16649-1, ISO 16649-2 (2008) method were performed.

Statistical Analysis

The collected data were coded and analyzed using Statistical Packaging for the Social Sciences (SPSS/PC version 21 for windows). Data were analyzed for descriptive statistical analysis to test for significant differences (P < 0.05) between the different chilling methods and the related process steps.

RESULTS

The mean bacterial load count of legs samples was highly significantly greater in emersion method $(2.1\pm.05)$ compared to air chilling method $(.7\pm.1)$, p=.000. Also, the mean bacterial count of breast $(1.8\pm.08 \text{ vs. } 1.6\pm.2)$, thigh $(1.9\pm.1\text{ vs. } 1.8\pm.1)$, backbone $(1.8\pm.08 \text{ vs. } 1.5\pm.2)$ and wings $(1.6\pm.1 \text{ vs. } 1.5\pm.1)$ was not significantly greater in emersion method compared to air chilling method, respectively, p> 0.05 (Table 1).

 Table 1: Mean of bacterial load count Log 10 (CFU/ml) X 10⁵ in MacConkey Agar (MCA) media for enterobacteriaceae from different carcass sites with different chilling methods

Chilling method	Sample location					
	Statistic	legs	Breast	Thigh	Backbone	Wings
Emersion	Mean± SE	2.1±.05	$1.8 \pm .08$	1.9±.1	$1.8 \pm .08$	$1.6 \pm .1$
	Minimum	1.7	1.3	1.2	1.2	1.0
	Maximum	2.4	2.5	2.8	2.3	2.4
Air chilling	Mean± SE	$0.7 \pm .1$	1.6±.2	$1.8 \pm .1$	$1.5 \pm .2$	$1.5 \pm .1$
	Minimum	0.3	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.7
	Maximum	2.4	2.5	2.5	2.5	2.5
Total	Mean± SE	$1.4 \pm .1$	$1.7 \pm .1$	$1.8 \pm .1$	$1.7 \pm .1$	$1.6 \pm .1$
	Minimum	0.3	0.00	1.00	0.00	0.7
	Maximum	2.4	2.5	2.8	2.5	2.5
ANOVA (P-value)		0.00*	0.445	0.814	0.084	0.681

SE = Standard error of means

*P-value considered significant at less than 0.05 levels

Table (2) represents the incidences and microbial counts for enterobacteriaceae and *E. coli* in emersion and air chilling methods using Ethylene Methylene Blue (EMB). The result indicates highly significant differences between the two chilling methods with regard to *Enterobacter and Citrobacter* (.017), *Shigella* (.004), *Klebseilla* (0.001), *E.coli+Salomnella and E.coli+Enterobacter* (0.00), *E.coli+Shigella* (0.001), *E.coli+Citrobacter* (0.00), *and Enterobacter+ Citrobacter* (.041).

This study also investigated the two chilling methods with their related process steps using a checklist. Concerning scalding water change during each shift, all slaughterhouses (100%) were not changing scalding water during the shift. Also, no significant difference was found between scalding water change during the shift and all chickens immersed together (Table 3).

Table (4) shows the efficacy of defeathering machines to keep chickens not to fall down, proper cleaning of defeathering fingers and chicken pass with feather return to machine for more trimming in the two methods. Nonetheless, no significant differences were found between the two methods, with p > 0.214.

Table (5) shows that no significant difference was found between the two chilling methods in terms of opening viscera mechanically, chicken hanged on legs until evisceration process step finished, technique for viscera suction and in and out washing machine for carcasses. No significant differences were found between the two methods, with p > 0.214.

Table (6) revealed no significant difference between the two chilling methods in terms of in and out washing of carcass and availability of potable water free from salt with p .214 and .500, respectively.

The study revealed that sodium chloride was used in three quarters 3 (75%) of the slaughterhouses using immersion chilling method and one quarter used citric acid, while half (2) (50%) of the slaughterhouses using air chilling method used sodium chloride. There was no significant difference between the two chilling methods, with p>.500.

The study also revealed that only half of the slaughterhouses using immersion chilling didn't change water of chillers during shifts. There was significant difference between the two chilling methods with p > .018.

 Table 2:
 Incidences and microbial counts for enterobacteriaceae and *E. coli* in emersion and air chilling methods using EMB

E.coliEmersion Air chilling0.163 0.1270.029 0.024EnterobacterEmersion Total0.0880.032 0.012CitrobacterEmersion Air chilling0.0200.012 0.013CitrobacterEmersion Air chilling0.0270.013 0.017*ShigellaEmersion Air chilling0.0070.000 0.0007KlebseillaEmersion Air chilling0.0070.001 0.001KlebseillaEmersion Air chilling0.0260.011 0.000SalmonellaEmersion Air chilling0.120 0.0000.001*brSalmonellaEmersion Air chilling0.1300.022E.coli + SalomnellaEmersion Air chilling0.1300.002*brE.coli + SalomnellaEmersion Air chilling0.0130.000*brE.coli + SalomnellaEmersion Air chilling Air chilling0.0160.00*brE.coli + SalomnellaEmersion Air chilling Air chilling0.0300.00*brE.coli + SalomnellaEmersion Air chilling Air chilling0.0300.00*brE.coli + ShigellaEmersion Air chilling Air chilling0.0300.00*brE.coli + ShigellaEmersion Air chilling Air chilling0.0300.00*brE.coli + ShigellaEmersion Air chilling Air chilling0.030.01*brE.coli + ShigellaEmersion Air chilling0.030.01*brE.coli + ShigellaEmersion Air chilling0.030.01*brE.coli + ShigellaEmersio	Type of bacteria	Chilling method	Mean	SE	Sig.
Air chilling 0.147 0.029 0.017 Total 0.152 0.024 Enterobacter Emersion 0.088 0.032 0.017* Air chilling 0.027 0.013 0.017* Citrobacter Emersion 0.007 0.007 Mir chilling 0.025 0.013 0.017* Shigella Emersion 0.075 0.030 0.004* Klebseilla Emersion 0.007 0.000 0.001* Klebseilla Emersion 0.150 0.000 0.001* Salmonella Emersion 0.150 0.402 0.522 E.coli+Salomnella Emersion 0.130 0.002 0.00* Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.00* 0.00* E.coli+Salomnella Emersion 0.188 0.041 0.00* E.coli+Enterobacter Emersion 0.018 0.00* 0.00* E.coli+Shigella Emersion 0.075 0.030 0.01* E.totir	E.coli	Emmersion	0.163	0.042	0.75
Interval Interval 0.152 0.0124 Enterobacter Emersion 0.088 0.032 0.017* Air chilling 0.027 0.013 0.017* Citrobacter Emersion 0.010 0.034 0.017* Total 0.052 0.010 0.014* Air chilling 0.007 0.007 0.004* Shigella Emersion 0.075 0.030 0.004* Klebseilla Emersion 0.015 0.000 0.001* Klebseilla Emersion 0.150 0.000 0.001* Salmonella Emersion 0.130 0.002 0.522 E.coli+Salomnella Emersion 0.130 0.000* 0.000* Total 0.055 0.016 0.000* 0.000* E.coli+Salomnella Emersion 0.013 0.000* 0.000* E.coli+Salomnella Emersion 0.038 0.01* 0.00* E.coli+Shigella Emersion 0.038 0.01* 0.00*		Air chilling	0.147	0.029	0.75
Enterobacter Emersion Air chilling 0.088 0.032 0.017* Air chilling 0.020 0.012 Citrobacter Emersion Air chilling 0.027 0.013 Shigella Emersion Air chilling 0.007 0.007 Shigella Emersion Air chilling 0.007 0.004* Klebseilla Emersion Air chilling 0.000 0.000* Salmonella Emersion Air chilling 0.000 0.000 Schonella Emersion Air chilling 0.150 0.402 Schonella Emersion Air chilling 0.005 0.000 E.coli+Salomnella Emersion Air chilling 0.000 0.000* E.coli+Enterobacter Emersion Air chilling 0.000 0.000* Total 0.033 0.011 0.000* E.coli+Enterobacter Emersion Air chilling 0.000 0.000* E.coli+Shigella Emersion Air chilling 0.030 0.001* E.coli+Shigella Emersion Air chilling 0.000 0.000* E.coli+Shigella Emersion Air chilling		Total	0.152	0.024	
Air chilling 0.020 0.012 Total 0.043 0.012 Citrobacter Emersion 0.103 0.017* Air chilling 0.027 0.013 Shigella Emersion 0.075 0.030 Air chilling 0.007 0.004* Air chilling 0.007 0.004* Klebseilla Emersion 0.075 0.300 Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.001 Salmonella Emersion 0.150 0.402 Air chilling 0.120 0.266 0.011 Salmonella Emersion 0.188 0.042 Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.000* Cital 0.083 0.018 0.000* E.coli+Salomnella Emersion 0.138 0.042 E.coli+Shigella Emersion 0.013 0.000* Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.001* E.coli+Shigella Emersion 0.075 0.30 <t< td=""><td>Enterobacter</td><td>Emersion</td><td>0.088</td><td>0.032</td><td>0.017*</td></t<>	Enterobacter	Emersion	0.088	0.032	0.017*
Total 0.043 0.012 Citrobacter Emersion Air chilling 0.007 0.013 0.017* Shigella Emersion Air chilling 0.007 0.000 0.004* Klebseilla Emersion Air chilling 0.007 0.001 Klebseilla Emersion Air chilling 0.000 0.000 Salmonella Emersion Air chilling 0.120 0.000 Salmonella Emersion Air chilling 0.130 0.022 E.coli+Salomnella Emersion Air chilling 0.130 0.000 E.coli+Salomnella Emersion Air chilling 0.130 0.000 E.coli+Enterobacter Emersion Air chilling 0.013 0.000 E.coli+Enterobacter Emersion Air chilling 0.006 0.000* E.coli+Enterobacter Emersion Air chilling 0.030 0.011 E.coli+Shigella Emersion Air chilling 0.030 0.001* E.coli+Citrobacter Emersion Air chilling 0.030 0.014* E.coli+Shigella Emersion Air chilling 0.030 0.014* E.coli+Citr		Air chilling	0.020	0.012	
Citrobacter Emersion Air chilling 0.100 0.034 0.017* 0.013 0.013 Shigella Emersion Air chilling 0.007 0.000 0.004* Klebseilla Emersion Air chilling 0.007 0.000 0.001* Klebseilla Emersion Air chilling 0.002 0.001* Salmonella Emersion Air chilling 0.000 0.000 Salmonella Emersion Air chilling 0.130 0.022 E.coli+Salonmella Emersion Air chilling 0.130 0.000* E.coli+Shigella Emersion Air chilling 0.005 0.016 E.coli+Enterobacter Emersion Air chilling 0.006 0.000* E.coli+Enterobacter Emersion Air chilling 0.000 0.000* E.coli+Shigella Emersion Air chilling 0.000 0.001* E.coli+Cirobacter Emersion Air chilling 0.030 0.011* E.coli+Shigella Emersion Air chilling 0.030 0.011* E.coli+Shigella Emersion 0.038 0.021 Enterobacter Emersion		Total	0.043	0.012	
Air chilling Total 0.027 0.052 0.013 0.014 Shigella Emersion Air chilling 0.007 0.030 0.004* Klebseilla Emersion Air chilling 0.007 0.030 0.001* Klebseilla Emersion Air chilling 0.000 0.000 Total 0.026 0.011 Salmonella Emersion Air chilling 0.150 0.402 0.000* E.coli+Salomnella Emersion Air chilling 0.000 0.000* E.coli+Salomnella Emersion Air chilling 0.003 0.013 E.coli+Salomnell	Citrobacter	Emersion	0.100	0.034	0.017*
Total 0.052 0.015 Shigella Emersion 0.075 0.030 0.004* Air chilling 0.007 0.030 0.001* Klebseilla Emersion 0.075 0.030 0.001* Klebseilla Emersion 0.026 0.011 Salmonella Emersion 0.150 .0402 0.522 Scolit+Salomnella Emersion 0.188 0.044 0.000* Air chilling 0.100 0.000 0.000* 0.000* E.coli+Salomnella Emersion 0.188 0.044 0.000* E.coli+Enterobacter Emersion 0.213 0.046 0.000* Air chilling 0.001 0.013 0.001 0.00* E.coli+Enterobacter Emersion 0.076 0.030 0.00* Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.00* Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.00* 0.00* E.coli+Shigella Emersion 0.038 0.021		Air chilling	0.027	0.013	0.017
Shigella Emersion Air chilling 0.075 0.030 0.004* Klebseilla Emersion Air chilling 0.000 0.001 Klebseilla Emersion Air chilling 0.000 0.001* Salmonella Emersion Air chilling 0.150 0.402 Salmonella Emersion Air chilling 0.120 0.522 E.coli+Salomnella Emersion Air chilling 0.000 0.000* Total 0.130 0.022 0.00* E.coli+Salomnella Emersion Air chilling 0.000 0.000* Total 0.083 0.018 0.00* E.coli+Enterobacter Emersion Air chilling 0.000 0.000 E.coli+Shigella Emersion Air chilling 0.000 0.000 E.coli+Citrobacter Emersion Air chilling 0.000 0.000 Total 0.030 0.011 0.04* Enterobacter Emersion 0.035 0.04* E.coli+Shigella Emersion 0.038 0.021 0.04* E.coli+Shigella Emersion <td< td=""><td></td><td>Total</td><td>0.052</td><td>0.015</td><td></td></td<>		Total	0.052	0.015	
Air chilling0.0070.0070.001Total0.0300.011KlebseillaEmersion0.0750.030Air chilling0.0000.000Total0.0260.011SalmonellaEmersion0.1500.402Air chilling0.1200.2660.522E.coli+SalomnellaEmersion0.1880.044Air chilling0.0000.0000.000E.coli+EnterobacterEmersion0.1330.009Total0.0830.0180.008E.coli+EnterobacterEmersion0.0760.303Air chilling0.0000.0000.001Total0.0260.0110.001E.coli+ShigellaEmersion0.0760.303Air chilling0.0000.0000.001Total0.0300.0110.013E.coli+CitrobacterEmersion0.0750.030+CitrobacterEmersion0.0750.030+CitrobacterEmersion0.0380.011EnterobacterEmersion0.0130.013+CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013+CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013+EnterobacterEmersion0.0130.013+CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013+CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013+CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013+CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013+Citrobacter </td <td>Shigella</td> <td>Emersion</td> <td>0.075</td> <td>0.030</td> <td>0.004*</td>	Shigella	Emersion	0.075	0.030	0.004*
Total 0.030 0.011 Klebseilla Emersion 0.075 0.030 0.001^* Air chilling 0.002 0.001 0.001^* 0.001^* Salmonella Emersion 0.150 0.402 0.522 Air chilling 0.120 0.266 0.522 E.coli+Salomnella Emersion 0.188 0.004^* Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.000^* E.coli+Enterobacter Emersion 0.213 0.046 Air chilling 0.013 0.009 0.000^* Total 0.026 0.011 0.000^* E.coli+Enterobacter Emersion 0.076 0.030 0.001^* Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.000^* 0.00^* E.coli+Cirobacter Emersion 0.030 0.011 0.04^* Air chilling 0.030 0.011 0.00^* 0.04^* E.coli+Shigella Emersion 0.030 0.013 0.013^* E.col		Air chilling	0.007	0.007	0.001
KlebseillaEmersion Air chilling0.0750.030 0.0000.001*Total0.0260.0000.0000.0000.000SalmonellaEmersion Air chilling0.130 0.1300.0220.522E.coli+SalomnellaEmersion Air chilling0.130 0.0000.0000.000*E.coli+ShigellaEmersion Air chilling0.013 0.0000.000*E.coli+ShigellaEmersion Air chilling0.013 0.0000.000*E.coli+ShigellaEmersion Air chilling0.000 0.0000.000*E.coli+CitrobacterEmersion Air chilling0.000 0.0000.000*E.coli+CitrobacterEmersion Air chilling0.000 0.0000.000*E.coli+CitrobacterEmersion Air chilling0.030 0.0000.001*Enterobacter +CitrobacterEmersion Air chilling0.030 0.0110.013 0.013Enterobacter +CitrobacterEmersion Air chilling0.038 0.0210.09*Enterobacter +CitrobacterEmersion Air chilling0.001 0.0000.000Enterobacter +CitrobacterEmersion Air chilling0.013 0.0130.013 0.013Enterobacter +SalomnellaEmersion Air chilling0.000 0.0000.000Enterobacter +salomnellaEmersion Air chilling0.013 0.0130.17 0.17Enterobacter +salomnellaEmersion Air chilling0.001 0.0010.17 0.17E.coli+klebsiella +citrobacterEmersion Air chilling <t< td=""><td></td><td>Total</td><td>0.030</td><td>0.011</td><td></td></t<>		Total	0.030	0.011	
Air chilling Total0.0000.000SalmonellaEmersion Air chilling0.1500.0402 0.226E.coli+SalomnellaEmersion Air chilling0.1300.022E.coli+SalomnellaEmersion Air chilling0.1880.044 0.0000.000*Total0.0000.0000.000*Total0.0050.0160.000*E.coli+ShigellaEmersion Air chilling0.0130.009 0.000E.coli+ShigellaEmersion Air chilling0.0380.001*E.coli+CitrobacterEmersion Air chilling0.0000.001*Total0.0030.001*0.00*Air chilling0.0000.0000.00*Air chilling0.0000.0000.00*Enterobacter + CitrobacterEmersion Air chilling0.0380.021Enterobacter + CitrobacterEmersion Air chilling0.0380.021Enterobacter + CitrobacterEmersion Air chilling0.0380.021Enterobacter + CitrobacterEmersion0.0380.021Enterobacter + CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013Enterobacter + CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013Enterobacter + CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013Enterobacter + CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013Enterobacter + CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013Coli+ Enterobacter + CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013Coli+ Entero	Klebseilla	Emersion	0.075	0.030	0.001*
$\begin{array}{ c c c c c } \hline Total & 0.026 & 0.011 \\ \hline Salmonella & Emersion & 0.150 & 0.402 \\ Air chilling & 0.130 & 0.022 \\ \hline Total & 0.130 & 0.022 \\ \hline E.coli+Salomnella & Emersion & 0.188 & 0.044 \\ Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.065 & 0.016 \\ \hline E.coli+Enterobacter & Emersion & 0.213 & 0.046 \\ Air chilling & 0.013 & 0.009 \\ \hline Total & 0.083 & 0.018 \\ \hline E.coli+Enterobacter & Emersion & 0.076 & 0.030 \\ Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.026 & 0.011 \\ \hline E.coli+Shigella & Emersion & 0.076 & 0.030 \\ Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.026 & 0.011 \\ \hline E.coli+Shigella & Emersion & 0.088 & 0.032 \\ Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.030 & 0.011 \\ \hline E.coli+Citrobacter & Emersion & 0.088 & 0.032 \\ Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.030 & 0.011 \\ \hline E.terobacter & Emersion & 0.075 & 0.030 \\ - Total & 0.039 & .0128 \\ \hline Enterobacter & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 \\ +Citrobacter & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 \\ +Citrobacter & Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline E.coli+Salomnella & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 \\ +Enterobacter & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 \\ +Citrobacter & Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline E.coli+klebsiella & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 \\ +Citrobacter & Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline E.coli+klebsiella & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 \\ +Citrobacter & Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline E.coli+klebsiella & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 \\ +Citrobacter & Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline E.coli+klebsiella & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 \\ +Citrobacter & Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline E.coli+klebsiella & Emersion & 0.003 & 0.001 \\ \hline E.coli+klebsiella & Emersion & 0.003 & 0.0$		Air chilling	0.000	0.000	0.001
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $		Total	0.026	0.011	
Air chiling Total0.120 0.1300.022 0.002E.coli+SalomnellaEmersion Air chiling0.1880.044 0.000Air chiling0.0000.000Total0.0650.016E.coli+EnterobacterEmersion Air chiling0.0130.009 0.000Total0.0830.018E.coli+ShigellaEmersion Air chiling0.0260.001*E.coli+ShigellaEmersion Air chiling0.030 0.0000.001*E.coli+CitrobacterEmersion Air chiling0.030 0.0000.001*E.coli+CitrobacterEmersion Air chiling0.030 0.0000.004*Enterobacter +CitrobacterEmersion Air chiling0.030 0.0110.014*Enterobacter +CitrobacterEmersion Air chiling0.030 0.0130.04*Enterobacter +CitrobacterEmersion Air chiling0.013 0.0380.011Enterobacter +CitrobacterEmersion 	Salmonella	Emersion	0.150	.0402	0.522
Iotal0.1300.002E.coli+SalomnellaEmersion0.1880.044Air chilling0.0000.000Total0.0650.016E.coli+EnterobacterEmersion0.2130.046Air chilling0.0130.0090.000*Total0.0830.0180.000*E.coli+ShigellaEmersion0.0760.030Air chilling0.0000.0000.001*Total0.0260.0110.00*E.coli+CitrobacterEmersion0.0880.032Air chilling0.0000.0000.00*ConterEmersion0.0750.030ConterEmersion0.0750.030ConterEmersion0.0380.021EnterobacterEmersion0.0380.021+CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013+CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013+CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013+CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013+CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013+CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013+SalomnellaAir chilling0.0000.000+coli+EnterobacterEmersion0.0130.013+coli+EnterobacterEmersion0.0130.013+coli+EnterobacterEmersion0.0130.013+coli+EnterobacterAir chilling0.0040.004+coli+LebsiellaEmersion0.0130.013<		Air chilling	0.120	.0266	
E.coli+Salomnella Emersion 0.188 0.044 0.000* Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.000* Total 0.005 0.013 0.009 E.coli+Enterobacter Emersion 0.213 0.046 0.000* Total 0.083 0.018 0.000* 0.000* E.coli+Shigella Emersion 0.076 0.030 0.001* E.coli+Shigella Emersion 0.026 0.011 0.00* Total 0.026 0.011 0.00* 0.00* E.coli+Shigella Emersion 0.088 0.032 0.00* Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.00* 0.04* Enterobacter Emersion 0.075 0.030 0.04* +Citrobacter Emersion 0.038 0.021 0.09* +Citrobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.014 +Citrobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +Enterobacter Emersion 0.013	F <i>V</i> G <i>V</i>	Total	0.130	0.022	
Air chiling Total0.000 0.0000.000 0.000E.coli+EnterobacterEmersion Air chiling0.213 0.0030.004 0.0008E.coli+ShigellaEmersion Air chiling0.0076 0.030 0.00160.0011E.coli+ShigellaEmersion Air chiling0.0026 0.0010.0011E.coli+CitrobacterEmersion Air chiling0.000 0.0000.0007Enterobacter +CitrobacterEmersion Air chiling0.030 0.0110.011Enterobacter +CitrobacterEmersion Air chiling0.030 0.0120.044Enterobacter +CitrobacterEmersion Air chiling0.039 0.0130.044Enterobacter +CitrobacterEmersion Air chiling0.013 0.0130.013 0.013Enterobacter +CitrobacterEmersion Air chiling0.013 0.0040.004E.coli+Salomnella +Enterobacter +salmonellaEmersion Air chiling0.013 0.0130.17 0.17Enterobacter +salmonellaEmersion Air chiling0.013 0.0040.17 0.17E.coli+klebsiella +CitrobacterEmersion Air chiling 0.0040.004E.coli+klebsiella +CitrobacterEmersion Air chiling 0.0040.004E.coli+klebsiella +CitrobacterEmersion Air chiling 0.0040.013 0.004E.coli+klebsiella +CitrobacterEmersion Air chiling 0.0040.004E.coli+klebsiella +CitrobacterEmersion Air chiling Air chiling0.013 0.0060.17 0.052E.coli+klebsiella Air	E.coli+Salomnella	Emersion	0.188	0.044	0.000*
Initial 0.000 model 0.011 model E.coli+Enterobacter Emersion Air chilling 0.013 model 0.000* Air chilling 0.013 model 0.000 0.000* E.coli+Shigella Emersion Air chilling 0.006 model 0.001* E.coli+Shigella Emersion Total 0.026 model 0.001* E.coli+Citrobacter Emersion Milling 0.000 model 0.00* Air chilling 0.000 model 0.000 model 0.00* Enterobacter + Citrobacter Emersion Total 0.030 model 0.04* Air chilling 0.020 model 0.011 0.04* Enterobacter + Citrobacter + Shigella Emersion model 0.038 model 0.04* Enterobacter + Shigella Emersion model 0.038 model 0.01 Enterobacter + Shigella Emersion model 0.004 model 0.04* Enterobacter + Shigella Emersion model 0.013 model 0.017 + Enterobacter + Shigella Emersion model 0.004 model 0.017 + Enterobacter + shigella Emersion model 0.004 model <td></td> <td>Air chilling</td> <td>0.000</td> <td>0.000</td> <td></td>		Air chilling	0.000	0.000	
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	E coli⊥Enterobacter	Emersion	0.003	0.010	
Total0.01830.018E.coli+ShigellaEmersion Air chilling0.0000.000Air chilling0.0000.0000.001*E.coli+CitrobacterEmersion Air chilling0.0000.000Air chilling0.0000.0000.000Total0.0300.0110.00*Enterobacter + CitrobacterEmersion0.0750.030 0.0300.04*Enterobacter + CitrobacterEmersion0.0380.0210.04*Enterobacter + CitrobacterEmersion0.0380.0210.09E.coli+Salomnella + EnterobacterEmersion0.0130.013 0.0130.17Enterobacter + CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013 0.0000.17Enterobacter + CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013 0.0130.17Enterobacter + CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013 0.0130.17Enterobacter + CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013 0.0130.17Enterobacter + SalmonellaEmersion0.0130.013 0.0130.17E.coli+klebsiella + CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013 0.0130.17E.coli+klebsiella + CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013 0.0040.004E.coli+klebsiella + CitrobacterEmersion0.013 0.0130.013 0.0130.17E.coli+klebsiella + CitrobacterEmersion0.025 0.0130.014E.coli+klebsiella + CitrobacterEmersion	E.con Emerobacier	Air chilling	0.013	0.009	0.000*
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $		Total	0.083	0.018	
Air chilling Total0.0000.0000.001E.coli+CitrobacterEmersion0.0880.032 0.00^* Air chilling0.0000.0000.000 0.00^* Total0.0300.0110.001 0.00^* Enterobacter +CitrobacterEmersion0.0750.030 0.04^* Enterobacter +CitrobacterTotal0.020.0115 0.04^* Enterobacter +CitrobacterEmersion0.0380.021 0.09^* Enterobacter +CitrobacterEmersion0.0380.021 0.09^* Enterobacter +CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013 0.17^* Enterobacter +CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013 0.17^* Enterobacter +salmonellaEmersion0.0130.013 0.17^* Escoli+Enterobacter +salmonellaEmersion0.0130.013 0.17^* Escoli+Enterobacter +CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013 0.17^* Escoli+klebsiella +CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013 0.17^* Escoli+klebsiella +CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013 0.17^* Escoli+klebsiella +CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013 0.17^* Escoli+klebsiella +CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013 0.17^* Escoli+klebsiella +CitrobacterEmersion0.004 0.004 0.004 Escoli+klebsiella +CitrobacterEmersion0.013 0.013 0.013 Es	E.coli+Shigella	Emersion	0.076	0.030	0.001*
Total0.0260.011E.coli+CitrobacterEmersion0.0880.032 0.00^* Air chilling0.0000.0000.001Total0.0300.0110.0300.011EnterobacterEmersion0.0750.030 0.04^* +CitrobacterTotal0.0390.1280.04*EnterobacterTotal0.0390.0120.09EnterobacterEmersion0.0380.0210.09EnterobacterEmersion0.0130.0130.17+Citrobacter+shigellaEmersion0.0130.0130.17+EnterobacterEmersion0.0130.0130.17+EnterobacterEmersion0.0130.0130.17+EnterobacterEmersion0.0130.0130.17+salmonellaEmersion0.0130.0130.17+salmonellaEmersion0.0130.0130.17+citrobacterEmersion0.0130.0130.17+citrobacterAir chilling0.0000.0000.17+CitrobacterAir chilling0.0040.0040.014+CitrobacterAir chilling0.0040.0040.052E.coli+klebsiellaEmersion0.0130.0130.17+CitrobacterAir chilling0.0000.0000.052E.coli+klebsiellaEmersion0.0130.0130.17+CitrobacterAir chilling0.0040.0040.052-Coli+klebsiel		Air chilling	0.000	0.000	0.001*
E.coli+Citrobacter Emersion 0.088 0.032 0.00^* Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.000 Total 0.030 0.011 Enterobacter Emersion 0.075 0.030 0.04^* +Citrobacter Finersion 0.039 .0115 0.04^* Enterobacter Total 0.039 .0128 0.04^* Enterobacter Finersion 0.038 0.021 0.09^* Ecoli+Salomnella Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 Enterobacter Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.17^* Enterobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17^* Enterobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17^* exalmonella Emersion		Total	0.026	0.011	
Air chilling Total 0.000 0.000 Enterobacter +Citrobacter Emersion 0.075 0.030 $_{0.04*}$ Air chilling 0.020 .0115 $_{0.04*}$ Enterobacter Total 0.039 .0128 Enterobacter Emersion 0.038 0.021 0.09 Enterobacter Emersion 0.038 0.021 0.09 E.coli+Salomnella Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +Enterobacter Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.17 +Enterobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +Enterobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +salmonella Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +salmonella Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +Citrobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +Citrobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +Citrobacter Emersion 0.013 <td< td=""><td>E.coli+Citrobacter</td><td>Emersion</td><td>0.088</td><td>0.032</td><td>0.00*</td></td<>	E.coli+Citrobacter	Emersion	0.088	0.032	0.00*
Total 0.030 0.011 Enterobacter Emersion 0.075 0.030 0.04^* + Citrobacter Air chilling 0.020 .0115 0.04^* Enterobacter Total 0.039 .0128 0.09^* Enterobacter Emersion 0.038 0.021 0.09 E.coli+Salomnella Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17^* +Enterobacter Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.17^* +Enterobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17^* +Enterobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17^* +salmonella Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17^* +salmonella Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17^* +citrobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17^* +citrobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17^* +Citrobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17^* +Citrobacter <td></td> <td>Air chilling</td> <td>0.000</td> <td>0.000</td> <td>0100</td>		Air chilling	0.000	0.000	0100
Enterobacter Emersion 0.075 0.030 $0.04*$ + Citrobacter Air chilling 0.020 0.115 Total 0.039 0.128 Enterobacter Emersion 0.038 0.021 0.09 Ectorbacter+shigella Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.013 Ectorbacter+shigella Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 Ectorbacter Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.013 +Enterobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 Enterobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +salmonella Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +salmonella Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +citrobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +Citrobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +Citrobacter Emersion 0.004 0.004 0.004		Total	0.030	0.011	
+ Chrobacter 0.04^* Air chilling 0.020 .0115 Total 0.039 .0128 Enterobacter Emersion 0.038 0.021 0.09 E.coli+Salonnella Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +Enterobacter Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.17 +Enterobacter Total 0.004 0.004 0.17 +Enterobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +salmonella Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +salmonella Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +citrobacter Emersion 0.004 0.004 0.004 +Citrobacter Air chilling 0.004 0.004	Enterobacter	Emersion	0.075	0.030	
Air chilling 0.020 $.0113$ Total 0.039 $.0128$ Enterobacter + Citrobacter+shigellaEmersion 0.038 0.021 0.09 E.coli+Salomnella + EnterobacterEmersion 0.013 0.013 $4 ir chilling0.0000.000Enterobacter+ salmonellaEmersion0.0130.013-170.17Enterobacter+ salmonellaEmersion0.0130.013-170.17Enterobacter+ salmonellaEmersion0.0130.0000.17Enterobacter+ salmonellaEmersion0.0130.013-170.17E.coli+Enterobacter+ CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013-170.17E.coli+klebsiella+ CitrobacterEmersion0.0130.013-170.17E.coli+klebsiella+ CitrobacterEmersion0.0040.0040.004E.coli+klebsiella+ kebseillaEmersion0.0130.013-170.0130.013-17E.coli+klebsiella+ kebseillaEmersion0.0040.0040.0040.052Salmonella+Citrobacter+ CitrobacterEmersion0.0000.0000.0070.077Total0.0070.0070.0070.0070.007$	+Clirobacler	A · 1 · 11·	0.000	0115	0.04*
Total 0.039 $.0128$ Enterobacter +Citrobacter+shigella Emersion 0.038 0.021 0.09 E.coli+Salomnella +Enterobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +Enterobacter Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.17 Enterobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +salmonella Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +salmonella Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +salmonella Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.17 +salmonella Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +salmonella Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +citrobacter Emersion 0.004 0.004 0.014 +Citrobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 +Citrobacter Air chilling 0.004 0.004 0.004 +Citrobacter Total 0.004 0.004		Air chilling	0.020	.0115	
Enterobacter Emersion 0.038 0.021 0.09 + Citrobacter + shigella Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.013 + Enterobacter Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.000 + Enterobacter Total 0.004 0.004 0.013 + salmonella Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 + salmonella Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.17 + salmonella Air chilling 0.004 0.004 0.17 + salmonella Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.17 + clirobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 0.17 + Citrobacter Emersion 0.004 0.004 0.004 + Citrobacter Air chilling 0.000 0.004 0.013 + Citrobacter Air chilling 0.000 0.004 0.052 E.coli+klebsiella Emersion 0.025 0.018 0.052 Air chilling 0	Entruchenten	Total	0.039	.0128	
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c } E.coli+Salomnella & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 & 0.013 & \\ +Enterobacter & Total & 0.004 & 0.004 & & \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 & & \\ Enterobacter & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 & 0.013 & & \\ +salmonella & Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 & & \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 & & \\ \hline E.coli+Enterobacter & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 & & \\ +Citrobacter & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 & & \\ +Citrobacter & Total & 0.004 & 0.004 & & \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 & & \\ \hline E.coli+klebsiella & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 & & \\ +Citrobacter & Total & 0.004 & 0.004 & & \\ \hline E.coli+klebsiella & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 & & \\ +Citrobacter & Total & 0.004 & 0.004 & & \\ \hline E.coli+klebsiella & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 & & \\ +Citrobacter & Total & 0.004 & 0.004 & & \\ \hline E.coli+klebsiella & Emersion & 0.025 & 0.018 & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.025 & 0.018 & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.000 & 0.000 & & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.005 & 0.018 & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.007 & 0.007 & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.000 & 0.000 & \\ \hline Total & 0.009 & .0061 & \\ \hline Total & 0.009 & .0061 & \\ \hline Total & 0.009 & .007 & 0.077 & \\ \hline Air chilling & 0.007 & 0.007 & \\ \hline Air chilling & 0.007 & 0.007 & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.000 & 0.000 & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.000 & 0.000 & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.000 & 0.000 & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.000 & 0.000 & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.000 & 0.000 & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.000 & 0.000 & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.000 & 0.000 & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.000 & 0.000 & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.000 & 0.000 & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.000 & 0.000 & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.000 & 0.000 & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.000 & 0.000 & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.000 & 0.000 & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.000 & 0.000 & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.000 & 0.000 & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.000 & 0.000 & \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.000 $	+Citrobacter+shigella	Emersion	0.038	0.021	0.09
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c } + Enterobacter & Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Enterobacter & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 \\ + salmonella & Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline E.coli+Enterobacter & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 \\ + Citrobacter & Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline E.coli+klebsiella & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 \\ + Citrobacter & Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline E.coli+klebsiella & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 \\ + Citrobacter & Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.025 & 0.018 \\ \hline Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.009 & .0061 \\ \hline Salmonella+Citrobacter & Emersion & 0.007 & 0.007 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total & 0.007 & 0.007 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total & 0.007 & 0.007 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total & 0.007 & 0.007 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total & 0.007 & 0.007 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total & 0.007 & 0.007 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total$	E.coli+Salomnella	Emersion	0.013	0.013	0.17
$\begin{tabular}{ c c c c } \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Enterobacter & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 \\ + salmonella & Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline E.coli+Enterobacter & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 \\ + Citrobacter & Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline E.coli+klebsiella & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 \\ + Citrobacter & Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline E.coli+klebsiella & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 \\ + Citrobacter & Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.025 & 0.018 \\ \hline Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.009 & .0061 \\ \hline Salmonella+Citrobacter & Emersion & 0.007 & 0.007 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total & 0.007 & 0.007 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline \end{tabular}$	+Enterobacter	Air chilling	0.000	0.000	0.17
$\begin{array}{c cccc} Enterobacter \\ +salmonella \\ +salmonella \\ Air chilling \\ Total \\ 0.000 \\ 0.000 \\ 0.000 \\ 0.000 \\ 0.000 \\ 0.000 \\ 0.001 \\ 0.004 \\ 0.052 \\ $		Total	0.004	0.004	
$ \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	Entruchenten	Emersion	0.013	0.013	
Air chilling 0.000 0.000 Total 0.004 0.004 E.coli+Enterobacter Emersion 0.013 0.013 +Citrobacter Air chilling 0.000 0.000 Total 0.004 0.004 0.004 E.coli+Enterobacter Air chilling 0.000 0.000 E.coli+klebsiella Emersion 0.013 0.013 +Citrobacter Air chilling 0.000 0.000 +Citrobacter Air chilling 0.004 0.004 E.coli+klebseilla Emersion 0.013 0.013 E.coli+kebseilla Emersion 0.025 0.018 Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.052 Air chilling 0.009 .0061 Salmonella+Citrobacter Emersion 0.000 0.007 Air chilling 0.007 0.007 0.47 Air chilling 0.004 0.004 0.044	±salmonella		0.015	0.015	0.17
$ \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c } \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total & 0.013 & 0.013 \\ + Citrobacter & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline E.coli+klebsiella & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 \\ + Citrobacter & Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.025 & 0.018 \\ \hline Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.009 & .0061 \\ \hline Salmonella+Citrobacter & Emersion & 0.007 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline \end{array} $	sumonena	Air chilling	0.000	0.000	
$\begin{array}{cccc} E.coli+Enterobacter & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 & 0.013 \\ +Citrobacter & Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline E.coli+klebsiella & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.013 \\ +Citrobacter & Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.025 & 0.018 \\ \hline Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.009 & .0061 \\ \hline Salmonella+Citrobacter & Emersion & 0.007 & 0.007 \\ \hline Air chilling & 0.007 & 0.007 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline \end{array}$	R # R	Total	0.004	0.004	
$ \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	E.coli+Enterobacter	Air chilling	0.013	0.013	0.17
$ \begin{array}{c cccc} F & 1004 & 0.004 \\ \hline E.coli+klebsiella & Emersion & 0.013 & 0.003 \\ +Citrobacter & Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.025 & 0.018 \\ Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.009 & .0061 \\ \hline Salmonella+Citrobacter & Emersion & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ Air chilling & 0.007 & 0.007 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline \end{array} $	+Cirobacier	Total	0.000	0.000	
+ Citrobacter Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.17 Total 0.004 0.004 0.004 E.coli+kebseilla Emersion 0.025 0.018 0.052 Air chilling 0.000 0.000 0.000 Total 0.009 .0061 Salmonella+Citrobacter Emersion 0.007 0.007 Total 0.004 0.004 0.004	E.coli+klebsiella	Emersion	0.004	0.004	
$\begin{tabular}{ c c c c c } \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.025 & 0.018 \\ Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.009 & .0061 \\ \hline Salmonella+Citrobacter & Emersion & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ Air chilling & 0.007 & 0.007 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline \end{tabular}$	+Citrobacter	Air chilling	0.000	0.000	0.17
$ \begin{array}{c} E.coli+kebseilla & Emersion & 0.025 & 0.018 \\ Air chilling & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ \hline Total & 0.009 & .0061 \\ \hline Salmonella+Citrobacter & Emersion & 0.000 & 0.000 \\ Air chilling & 0.007 & 0.007 \\ \hline Total & 0.004 & 0.004 \\ \hline \end{array} $		Total	0.004	0.004	
Air chilling 0.000 0.001 Total 0.009 .0061 Salmonella+Citrobacter Emersion 0.000 0.000 Air chilling 0.007 0.007 0.47 Total 0.004 0.004 0.004	E.coli+kebseilla	Emersion	0.025	0.018	0.052
Total 0.009 .0061 Salmonella+Citrobacter Emersion 0.000 0.000 0.47 Air chilling 0.007 0.007 0.007 Total 0.004 0.004 0.004		Air chilling	0.000	0.000	0.002
Salmonella+Citrobacter Emersion 0.000 0.000 Air chilling 0.007 0.007 Total 0.004 0.004		Total	0.009	.0061	
Saimonella+CitrobacterAir chilling0.0070.47Air chilling0.0070.007Total0.0040.004		Emersion	0.000	0.000	0.47
Total 0.004 0.004	Salmonella+Citrobacter	Air chilling	0.007	0.007	0.47
		Total	0.004	0.004	

*P-value considered significant at less than 0.05 level

EMB= Ethylene methylene blue, SE= Standard error of means

Table 3: Scalding processes with different chilling methods

Description	Response	Chilling	method	— Total	P-Value
Parameter		Immersion chilling	Air chilling		
Scalding water change	Yes	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	Not computed
during shift	No	4 (100%)	4 (100%)	8 (100%)	
Total		4 (100%)	4 (100%)	8 (100%)	
All chickens are immersed	Yes	2 (50%)	0 (0.0%)	2 (25%)	0.214
together in hard scalding	No	2 (50%)	4 (100%)	6 (75%)	
Total		4 (100%)	4 (100%)	8 (100%)	

Table 4: Defeathering procedures with different chilling methods

		Chilli	ing method		
Parameter	Response	Immersion chilling	Air chilling	Total	P-value
The efficacy of defeathering machines to keep	Yes	2 (50%)	4 (100%)	6 (75%)	0.214
chickens not to fall down; Proper cleaning of de- feathering machine rubber fingers	No	2 (50%)	0 (0.0%)	2 (25%)	
Total		4 (100%)	4 (100%)	8 (100%)	
Are chickens pass with feather return to machine	Yes	2 (50%)	0 (0.0%)	2 (25%)	
for more trimming?	No	2 (50%)	4 (100%)	6 (75%)	0.214
Total		4 (100%)	4 (100%)	8 (100%)	

Table 5: Evisceration procedures with different chilling methods

	Response	Chilling method		Total	P-Value
Parameter		Immersion chilling	Air chilling		
Is viscera mechanically opened? Are chickens hanged	Yes	2 (50%)	4 (100%)	6 (75%)	
on legs till the end of evisceration? Is there any technique for viscera suction?	No	2 (50%)	0 (0.0%)	2 (25%)	0.214
Total		4 (100%)	4 (100%)	8 (100%)	

Table 6: Washing procedures with different chilling methods

Demonstern	D	Chilling	method	T	DX
rarameter	Kesponse	Immersion chilling	Air chilling		P-value
Is there in and out washing	Yes	2 (50%)	4 (100%)	6 (75%)	
machine for washing carcasses?	No	2 (50%)	0 (0.0%)	2 (25%)	0.214
Total		4 (100%)	4 (100%)	8 (100%)	
Is potable water free from salt	Yes	1 (25%)	2 (50%)	3 (37.5%)	0.500
available?	No	3 (75%)	2 (50%)	5 (62.5%)	
Total		4 (100%)	4 (100%)	8 (100%)	

Demonster	Response	Chilling	The start	D 17.1	
rarameter		Immersion chilling	Air chilling	- Total	P-value
Chicken internal breast temperature	Yes	4(100%)	4(100%)	8(100%)	0.214
before entering chiller 40°C	No	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)	
Total		4 (100%)	4 (100%)	8 (100%)	
Chiller temperature more than 4°C	Yes	3 (75%)	0 (0.0%)	3 (37.5%)	0.071
reach 11°C	No	1 (25%)	4(100%)	5 (62.5%)	
Total		4 (100%)	4 (100%)	8 (100%)	
Water chiller is changed during shift	Yes	2 (50%)	0 (0.0%)	2 (25%)	0.018*
	No	2 (50%)	0 (0.0%)	2 (25%)	
	NA	0 (0.0%)	4 (100%)	4 (50%)	
Total		4 (100%)	4 (100%)	8 (100%)	

Table 7: Chilling procedures with different chilling methods

*P-value considered significant at less than 0.05 level

DISCUSSION

This study aimed to evaluate the effect of chilling method and its related process steps on chicken bacterial load in poultry processing plants in Khartoum State.

In this study the mean total values of the standard plate count were lower than values obtained by Abdalla *et al.* (2013) who recorded $8.16\pm0.11 \log 10$ CFU/ml for legs, $8.68\pm0.25 \log 10$ CFU/ml for back, $9.18\pm0.13 \log 10$ CFU/ml and for the breast. The reason for these lower bacterial findings was that this study expressed values of bacterial contamination after emersion or air chilling which logically preceded by lower microbial values. Similarly, higher results also were obtained by Abdalla *et al.* (2013) who reported that the TVC revealed the highest contamination level of the backs recorded after de-feathering was $9.99\pm0.01 \log 10$ CFU/ml, while the highest contamination level of the breasts after chilling and packing was 1.86 ± 0.01 log10 CFU/ml and the highest contamination level of the legs after scalding was $9.96 \pm 0.01 \log 10$ CFU/ml.

Also, higher results were revealed by Kabour (2011) who reported mean TVCs 7.69 ± 2.6 in legs, 7.49 ± 1.6 in backs and 8.38 ± 2.1 in breasts after defeathering. But the mean TVCs obtained from chicken carcasses after spray wash and after chilling and packing were lower than those reported in this study.

In this study the results of the effect of chilling methods on microbiological quality of meat revealed that the mean bacterial load count of legs samples was significantly greater in emersion method compared to air chilling method (p-value =.000). This might be due to poor cleaning and disinfection of rails and equipment, poor handling and poor health status of workers as observed by the researcher.

The study conducted by Geornaras *et al.* (1997) reported that contamination may occur due to bacterial contamination associated with water from the scald tank and from rubber fingers at the exit of defeathering machine.

This study revealed that scalding water was not changed during working shift in the two chilling methods. The effect of not changing scalding water during working shift in this study may pose hazards on the safety of broiler meat. This finding is in line with Anand *et al.* (1989) who stated that spoilage bacteria grow mainly on the skin surfaces, in the feather follicles and on cut muscle surfaces under the skin.

Defeathering process step is considered vital as birds arriving to the poultry slaughterhouse for processing are generally highly contaminated with bacteria, especially with potential human pathogenic bacteria, such as Coliform and Salmonella (Göksoy *et al.*, 2004).

In this study all plants used air chilling had defeathering machines efficient enough to keep chickens not to fall down, while only half of the plants used immersion chilling were efficient. These findings were found true in the bacteriological analysis in this study where bacterial load count was significantly greater in emersion method compared to air chilling method specifically in legs samples and not significantly greater in emersion method in breast, thigh, backbone and wings samples compared to air chilling method. This study showed that mechanical opening of the viscera was practiced in all plants that used air chilling, while only half of the plants used immersion chilling practiced it. This was evident in that bacterial load count was significantly greater in emersion method compared to air chilling method in terms of dealing with viscera. This finding is in line with that recorded by Hinton *et al.* (2000) who reported that broiler carcasses can be contaminated by bacteria when contact with ingesta and feces during evisceration.

This study revealed that all operations using air chilling method had in and out washing machines while only 50% of those using immersion method had such a system. Mead (2004) reported the importance of in and out washing machines of broiler carcasses in reducing TVCs and coliform bacteria counts.

Department of Agriculture, Food Safety and Inspection Service, demands the chilling of carcasses below 4.4 °C until 4 hours postmortem (Savell *et al.*, 2005).

This study displays the effect of chilling process step on reducing carcass temperature measured at internal breast from 40° C to 4° C. All slaughterhouses using air chilling method practiced optimal temperature. There was no significant difference between the two chilling methods, with p>0.071.

These findings were in line to that reported by James *et al.* (2006) who stated that in industrial processing of poultry, immediately after hot water scalding and the further steps poultry carcasses have to be chilled to reduce their temperature from approximately 40 to 4 °C, which contributes to ensure safe products.

The efficacy of air chilling and drying in this study is supported by the microbial load of chicken which was significantly lower (p-value =.000) than the immersion method.

On the other hand, several authors have postulated that surface drying during air chilling reduces water activity, retards bacterial growth, and causes enough injury to pathogenic bacteria to reduce recovery (Huezo *et al.*, 2007).

This study revealed that only half of the slaughterhouses using immersion chilling didn't change water of chillers during shifts and thereby practice cleaning and disinfection. This might be one of the reasons why in this study bacterial load in immersion method was higher than air chilling method as birds are usually soaked in a large pool of water with tons of other chickens and their bacteria. This is also evidenced by that stated by Mead *et al.* (2010) who reported that during slaughter, the chilling of poultry carcasses is one of the main points for potential contamination, requiring constant monitoring.

The addition of chemicals in immersion method during chilling resulted in the low microbial load in this study. This is also in line to that recorded by Ismail *et al.* (2001) who stated that the attempts to apply chemicals to reduce the microbial contamination of poultry carcasses such as acetic acid (2.5%), Trisodium phosphate (8%) and/or sodium hypochlorite (800 pm) had resulted in significant reduction in the number of microorganisms.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The study concluded that the situation of microbial contamination of poultry meat in all investigated slaughterhouses in Khartoum State was in the level recommended by International regulatory bodies. It is recommended that HACCP prerequisites programs should be well maintained in all poultry slaughterhouses.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The authors would like to thank the staff members of the laboratory of the College of Veterinary Medicine, University of Bahri, Sudan for their cooperation and support.

Competing Interest: The authors declare that they have no competing interest.

REFERENCES

Abdalla A.A., Suliman S.E., Shuaib Y.A. and Abdalla M.A. (2013). Bacteriological study of poultry meat in semiautomatic abattoir in Khartoum State-Sudan. Sudan Journal of Science and Technology, Vol. 14 Agricultural and Veterinary Sciences (JAVS No. 2).

Ahmed H.A. (2014). Bacterial contamination of chicken carcasses at abattoir in Khartoum State-Sudan. A dissertation submitted to Sudan University of Science and Technology for partial fulfillment of the requirement for Master degree of Preventive Veterinary Medicine (M.P.V.M).

Anand S.K., Mahapatra C.M., Pandey N.K. and Verma S.S. (1989). Microbiological changes on chicken carcasses during processing. Indian Journal of Poultry Science, 24(3): 203-209.

Geornaras I., de Jesus A., van Zyl E. and van Holy A. (1997). Bacterial populations of different sample types from car-casses in the dirty area of a South African poultry abattoir. J. Food Prot., 60: 551-554.

Göksoy E.Ö., Kirkan S. and Kök F. (2004). Microbiological quality of broiler carcasses during processing in two slaughterhouses in Turkey. Poultry Science, 83(8): 1427-1432.

Govender R. (2014). A hazard analysis methodology for the South African abattoir hygiene management system. British Food Hygiene, 116: 2026-2047.

Halkman, H. B. D. A. K. (2014). Extract from Encyclopedia of Food Microbiology (2nd ed.).

Hiton J., Buher R.J. and Ingram K.D. (2000). Physical, chemical and microbiological changes in the crop of broiler chickens subjected to incremental feed withdrawal. Poultry science, 79: 212-218.

Huezo R., Northcutt J.K., Smith D.P., Fletcher D.L. and Ingram K.D. (2007). Effect of dry air or immersion chilling on recovery of bacteria from broiler carcasses. Journal of Food Protection, 70(8): 1829-1834.

Ismail S.A.S., Deak T., Abd El-Rahman H.A., Yassien M.A.M., Beuchat L.R. (2001). Effectiveness of immersion treatment with acids, trisodium phosphate, and herb decoction in reducing population of Yarrowia lipolytica and naturally occurring aerobic microorganisms on raw chicken. Int. J. Food Microbiol., 64: 13-19.

ISO 13366-1 and IDF 148-1 (2008). Part 1: Microscopic method (Reference method). In: Milk – Enumeration of Somatic Cells. International Organization for Standardisation, Geneva, Switzerland.

James C., Vincent C., Andrade Lima T.I. and James S.J. (2006). The primary chilling of poultry carcasses–a review. Int. J. Refrig., 29:847-862.

Kabour G.A. (2011). Evaluation of Microbial Contamination of Chicken Carcasses during Processing in Khartoum State. M.V.Sc. Thesis Sudan University of Science and Technology, Sudan. Mead G.C. (2004). Meat quality and consumer requirements, in: G.C. Mead (Ed.). Poultry meat processing and quality, Woodhead Publishing Limited, Cambridge, pp. 1e20.

Mead, G., Lammerding, A. M., Cox, N., Doyle, M. P., Humbert, F., Kulikovskiy, A.,Zwietering, M. H. (2010). Scientific and technical factors affecting the setting of Salmonella criteria for raw poultry: a global perspective. Journal of Food Protection, 73(8), 1566-1590. https://doi.org/10.4315/0362-028X-73.8.1566

Munir E.H., Khalifa K.A. and Mohammed A.M. (2014). Status of food safety due to bacterial contaminants of poultry meat and poultry products in Khartoum State. JSRR 3(14): 1897-1904.

Mustafa E.A., Salman A.M.A. and Hamad I.M. (2016). Review on food safety system with reference to meat operations in Khartoum State, Sudan. RA Journal of Applied Research; 2(7): 491-504.

Omer Khalifa Abdelrahman Khalifa (2015). Studies on *Salmonella spp.* and *Escherichia coli* contamination in poultry meat carcasses at an automatic slaughterhouse in Khartoum State, Sudan. Thesis Master of Science in Veterinary Preventive Medicine and Public Health, Sudan University of Science and Technology.

Savell J.W., Mueller S.L. and Baird B.E. (2005). The chilling of carcasses. Meat Science, 70(3):449-459.